



## THE TOWNSHIP OF MILLBURN

375 MILLBURN AVENUE  
MILLBURN, NEW JERSEY 07041

MINUTES OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING  
TOWNSHIP OF MILLBURN  
COUNTY OF ESSEX  
February 6, 2020

A regular meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission was held on, February 6, 2020 at 7:30P.M. in Town Hall.

Chair Canfield opened the meeting by reading Section 5 of The Open Public Meeting Act, Chapter 231, Public Law 1975.

### ROLL CALL:

PRESENT: Mrs. Canfield, Mr. Frenkel, Mrs. Wanga, Mrs. Gaylord, Mr. Davis, Mr. Kramer, Mr. Owolabi,

ABSENT: Mrs. Sharma, Mrs. Esquivel, Barton Ross Historical Preservation Consultant

ALSO PRESENT: Attorney Andrew Brewer, Secretary Nicole Verducci

Mr. Frenkel arrived at 8:49 after recusing himself from the 66 Minnisink Application

### MEETING MINUTES

Upon a motion by Commissioner Wanga to approve the minutes of the January 9, 2020 meeting as submitted, seconded by Commissioner Gaylord and with unanimous voice vote, the minutes were approved.

### NEW BUSINESS

**Amended Application #381; 66 Minnisink Road; Block #3102, Lot #4, 5; Contributing Property; Short Hills Park Historic District / 66 Minnisink, LLC – Applicant**

Applicant seeks to amend application for the carriage house to become new construction.

Commissioner Frenkel recused himself from voting on this property.

**HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES****February 6, 2020**

Attorney Richard Skolnick, on behalf of the applicant gave the background of the property along with a timeline. The carriage house exterior will remain the same as the previously approved reconstruction.

The intention to move the Carriage House was not feasible due to the deterioration of the structure causing a stop work order to be put in place when the construction was occurring.

Mr. Brett Tanzman, speaking on behalf of the homeowner was sworn in as well as Terrance Weldon, Construction Project Manager and Amy Worth, John James Architecture, was sworn in.

Mr. Weldon stated that rehabilitating the Carriage House was the goal. Acquiring a house moving company to lift the home and moving it over to build a new foundation was the intention. Before lifting the house, mold and deterioration was found on the first floor which was removed. Upon returning the structure to the new foundation, the plate was bowed and the framing was not level causing it unusable. Mr. Weldon stated that efforts were made to add additional steel to the Carriage house and remove the studs for salvaging. Reframed perimeter walls on the first floor and the second floor deck were added. The second floor walls were also wavy making it an unsafe condition. Much of the wood was salvaged. Mr. Weldon stated that the exterior will be exactly as the approved plan similar to the main house.

Attorney Skolnick reiterated that a good faith effort was made to salvage the Carriage House.

Commissioner Wanga questioned what items were salvaged. Mr. Tanzman stated wood from the interior was salvaged. Commissioner Wanga asked if the Carriage House was level before lifting. Mr. Tanzman stated it was not. The steel was put through the house and strapped around in order to lift the structure. Mr. Tanzman stated that the intention was to sister the beams in the structure. The existing studs were showing no structural integrity. The second floor wall studs would have to sit level on the metal plate. Commissioner Wanga disagreed. Mrs. Wang asked what Mr. Tanzman found in the field that he was not aware of prior to the project. Mr. Tanzman stated that mold was an issue as well as deterioration. Mrs. Worth stated that the Carriage House was originally a horse stable. They are not built to the same standard as the main house. There was no way of knowing what they would find until demolition. The building was built close to grade causing rotting wood. The intentions were to try and use as much of the structure as possible. In the main house, the studs were able to be sistered. In the Carriage House, the structure was less sound due to twisted top plates making it difficult to get them level. A slate roof was chosen, which is heavier, causing a heavier rafter. Once the moving of the building began, it was found that the old structure was insufficient from the second floor up to support the roof. Commissioner Wanga asked when they were made aware of the issues. Mrs. Worth stated January. Commissioner Wanga asked when the building was lifted. Mr. Tanzman stated they began in August. The house was not moved until September allowing them to build the foundation. The decision was made that the structure was unsafe the week of Christmas. Commissioner Wanga questioned if they were aware the structure couldn't hold a slate roof. Mr. Tanzman stated he knew.

Commissioner Davis shared his concern about what items are being retained. Mr Tanzman stated that wall studs and joists have been salvaged we well as the main front gable from over the door. He has agreed to work with Mr. Ross in order to salvage and reuse as much as possible. Studs were carefully removed one at a time with the intention of reuse.

**HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES****February 6, 2020**

Commissioner Gaylord and Mr. Owolowabi stated they are dumbstruck after looking at the pictures. Commissioner Gaylord finds it difficult to believe that you were not aware that due to a missing foundation, nothing would be level. Commissioner Gaylord stated that she can't believe you can't anticipate that this was not feasible. Mr. Tanzman stated that he believes it was testified previously that the foundation wasn't structurally sound. Attorney Skolnick confirmed it was testified. Commissioner Gaylord questioned if there is still a Mushroom House. Mr. Tanzman confirmed it is still there.

Commissioner Owolabi questioned if the material is going to be one to one. Mr. Tanzman confirmed the elements will resemble the main house as well as the stone on the retaining walls. Commissioner Owolabi asked if he ever moved a house before. Mr. Tanzman stated this was his first.

Chair Canfield, stated that after listening to the May 3<sup>rd</sup> Audio tape, the Carriage House was built in sections. Mr. Tanzman confirmed it was. Chair Canfield questioned how many levels of steps existed. Mr. Tanzman gave the stair locations.

Commissioner Wanga stated her disappointment and finds it unacceptable that nine months after the application, they were not made aware of these issues. She stated it is not unusual for a historic building to not be level or be moved. She stated Mr. Tanzman should have come back to the HPC for guidance on how to handle this building. Commissioner Wanga stated this could have been done properly and finds it a shame. Commissioner Wanga suggests the owner discuss this with their professional team and contractor because this was not done properly. Commissioner Wanga is concerned the craftsmanship of a historical house will be gone.

Commissioner Davis stated we need to be more involved with the retention before we are advised.

Commissioner Gaylord, Commissioner Owolabi agreed with Commissioner Wanga and Commissioner Davis' Comments.

Commissioner Kramer stated something should have been done to make the structure sounder for a slate roof and salvaged materials should be used.

Chair Canfield stated that after visiting the site with Mr. Ross, that the wood was severely termite and wood damaged. It would have been impossible to salvage and the wood panels are still available to take a look at. The upkeep on the structure was not done with a roof of multiple leaks. Chair Canfield stated that it is difficult to lift a house that has been built in multiple pieces. The fact is none of the structure met code today. Chair Canfield stated that even the best shape of the house was not salvageable. Chair Canfield believes they were desperately trying to figure out how to make this work. Chair Canfield stated it took our Building Department to stop the work. We will continue as a Historic Commission and she is disappointed it was not brought to our attention by the contractor.

Attorney Brewer read Mr. Ross's recommendations.

Commissioner Davis stated he is uncomfortable approving an application without clear conditions.

**HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES**

**February 6, 2020**

Attorney Skolnick feels consulting with Mr. Ross as an expert to salvage items is recommended. Commissioner Gaylord stated that Mr. Ross is not paid by the town to take on this project. Attorney Brewer stated it will be covered by the escrow.

Hearing no further comments or questions, Chair Canfield called for a motion.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Davis to approve Application #381 as submitted, seconded by Commissioner Gaylord and with a roll call vote as follows:

- Mr. Davis-Yes
- Mrs. Gaylord-Yes
- Mrs. Canfield-Yes
- Mrs. Wanga-Yes
- Mr. Kramer-Yes
- Mr. Owolabi-Yes

**MEMORIALIZATION**

Upon a motion by Commissioner Gaylord to approve the Resolution of Memorialization for Amended Application #381 as submitted, seconded by Commissioner Davis with a roll call vote as follows:

Upon a motion to approve Amended Application #381 as submitted,

- Mr. Davis-Yes
- Mrs. Gaylord-Yes
- Mrs. Canfield-Yes
- Mrs. Wanga-Yes
- Mr. Kramer-Yes
- Mr. Owolabi-Yes

said motion was carried

**Application #449: 94 Knollwood Rd., Block #2203, Lot #8; Contributing Property; Short Hills Park Historic District / Lauren & Giuseppe Incitti, Applicant**

Applicant seeks to renovate interior spaces with the addition of new windows, a raised patio, exterior siding repair, driveway relocation and other alterations.

Lauren & Giuseppe Incitti, Applicant, Timothy Klesse, Architect was sworn in.

Chair Canfield recusing herself making Commissioner Gaylord the Acting Chair. Roll call was taken.

Mr. Klesse gave a background of the house by circulating original drawings of elevations and plans. Mr. Klesse referred to existing windows. The existing circular driveway will be a paved area is. A raised patio is proposed off of the Western Drive side. A gas post light will be at the

**HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES****February 6, 2020**

street. Mr. Klesse, referring to the front elevations, will be using the existing materials, and replace the windows as the original one over one.

Mr. Klesse presented side elevations, showing a basement door and six over six windows. The second floor window will match the existing windows. The right side elevation (Taylor Road side) showed a one story addition that will be changed to match the first floor windows. Materials will match the original house. Referring to HPC7, the existing windows will be replaced with a single sheet of glass. A whole house fan will be removed. A stairway window was presented as disjointed. They will be replaced with two equal sash windows filled in with brick below.

Mr. Klesse stated the house will appear the same as it does today.

Mrs. Wanga questioned which windows are original. Mr. Klesse stated they are old and don't match. Commissioner Wanga asked for window placement clarification. Mr. Klesse showed what windows were recently replaced.

Commissioner Davis questioned the location of the stairwell to the windows. Commissioner Davis presented an old photo of the house with muttuns. Commissioner Davis asked for clarification of the existing driveway. Mr. Klesse presented the driveway. Commissioner Davis suggested a bush is replaced. Mr. Klesse agreed there is plenty of space to plant.

Commissioner. Owolabi questioned the patio location. Mr. Klesse presented a brick raised patio and planting at the base.

Hearing no further comments or questions, Chair Canfield called for a motion

Upon a motion by Commissioner Wanga to approve Application #449 as submitted, seconded by Commissioner Frenkel and with a roll call vote as follows:

Mr. Davis-Yes  
Mrs. Gaylord-Yes  
Mrs. Canfield-Yes  
Mrs. Wanga-Yes  
Mr. Kramer-Yes  
Mr. Owolabi-Yes  
Mr. Frenkel-Yes

**Application #450: 20 Highland Ave., Block #1501, Lot #11; Contributing Property; Short Hills Park Historic District / Brian & Sookie Koo, Applicant**

Applicant seeks to renovate the front entrance portico, build a rear addition necessitating deck changes, add a new circular driveway, and other misc. alterations.

Thomas Baio, Architect and Bryan Koo, Resident was sworn in.

Mr. Baio gave the history of the home along with views of the front and rear of the house. He stated that all window changes will be identical. Mr. Baio circulated photos of the existing and proposed house. Mr. Baio also circulated views of the garage, rear of the house and driveway

**HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES****February 6, 2020**

view. A rear areal of the house and the garage was circulated as well. A front portico will be added as if it belongs there delineating by using a metal roof. A mudroom in the rear of the house was presented, containing a side door. Mr. Baio presented two dormers that will be added allowing for a car lift in the garage, not changing the character and not visible from the street. The purpose of the dormers is solely for the use of the lifts. A bathroom will be added and some walls will be moved. Pella Architect style windows will be used as replacements. A Zoning variance is necessary due to lot coverage issues.

Attorney Brewer read Mr. Ross's recommendations to the Commissioners.

Commissioner Frenkel asked if the garage is the original. Mr. Baio stated it was built circa 1940. The garage will have no windows and will match the existing house. The garage door will be replaced with a designer wood garage door and cut sheets will be supplied to Mr. Ross.

Commissioner Owolabi questioned if the dormers will increase the height of the garage. Mr. Baio stated it is not changing. The dormers are on the sides of the garage, allowing a car to lift without obstruction from the angle of the roof allowing two lifts.

The Portico was presented in detail by Mr. Baio which was requested by Mr. Ross.

Commissioner Kramer asked if all windows are being replaced. Mr. Baio stated several windows are leaking and will look the same.

Commissioner Wanga asked how the roofline of the portico was decided. Mr. Baio stated he chose metal to distinguish the modern era. Commissioner Wanga and Gaylord feel the pitch doesn't match the roof. Mr. Baio will accept it as a condition.

Commissioner Davis stated he is not a fan of the driveway. Mr. Baio stated the ordinance states a continuous driveway is acceptable but the scale won't fit a car. Mr. Koo stated the circular driveway is for safety reasons. Mr. Baio stated the yard is too small to bring the driveway around the rear. Mr. Koo is willing to abandon the plans for a circular driveway. Commissioner Gaylord suggested a bump out for turning around. Mr. Baio stated if the board approves the variance they are willing.

A damaged mahogany door will be refurbished.

Chair Canfield asked the color of the metal roof. Mr. Baio stated it will be black. Chair Canfield asked for clarification on the siding materials. Mr. Baio stated it is wood and will be the same exposure and thickness as the house and garage. Chair Canfield would like to see a K turn driveway and agreed to recommend to the Zoning Board the driveway be changed.

Chair Canfield asked Mr. Koo to agree that the portico will be a shed roof with a slight pitch rather than a point. Mr. Koo agreed. Chair Canfield requested that cut sheets are presented for the garage door and windows. Chair Canfield also suggested that Mr. Baio consider an aged copper as a roof. Mr. Koo would prefer to stay with black due to the current color choices. Chair Canfield has accepted the black metal roof.

Mr. Baio has agreed to provide revised plans to Mr. Ross for approval.

---

**HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES**

**February 6, 2020**

Hearing no further comments or questions, Chair Canfield called for a motion

Upon a motion by Commissioner Wanga to approve Application #450 as submitted, seconded by Commissioner Owolabi and with a roll call vote as follows:

Mrs. Canfield-Yes

Mr. Davis-Yes

Mrs. Gaylord-Yes

Mrs. Wanga-Yes

Mr. Kramer-Yes

Mr. Owolabi-Yes

Mr. Frenkel-Yes

**DISCUSSION ITEMS**

Chair Canfield stated you will receive future Minor Work decisions and will now be a line item on the Agenda so if there are questions, they can be answered so there are no gaps in timelines.

**ADJOURNMENT**

With no further suggestions or comments from the Commission, the meeting was adjourned with a motion from Commissioner Gaylord seconded by Commissioner Wanga and with unanimous voice vote, meeting was adjourned at 9:57pm.

Respectfully submitted,

Nicole Verducci, HPC Secretary

---

The next meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission is March 5, 2020