



THE TOWNSHIP OF MILLBURN

375 MILLBURN AVENUE
MILLBURN, NEW JERSEY 07041

MINUTES OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING
TOWNSHIP OF MILLBURN
COUNTY OF ESSEX
July 11, 2019

A regular meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission was held on, July 11, 2019 at 7:30P.M. in Town Hall.

Chair Canfield opened the meeting by reading Section 5 of The Open Public Meeting Act, Chapter 231, Public Law 1975.

ROLL CALL:

PRESENT: Chair Canfield, Commissioner Frenkel, Commissioner Owolabi, Mrs. Wanga, Mrs. Gaylord, Mr. Kramer, Commissioner Esquivel, Mrs. Sharma,

ABSENT: Mr. Davis, Barton Ross

ALSO PRESENT: Attorney Andrew Brewer and Secretary Nicole Verducci

MEETING MINUTES

Upon a motion by Commissioner Gaylord to approve the minutes of the June 6, 2019 meeting as submitted, seconded by Commissioner Frenkel and with unanimous voice vote, the minutes were approved.

NEW BUSINESS

Application #436; 108 Glen Ave.; Block #705, Lot #9; Non-Contributing property; Wyoming Historic District / Wilbur Henry – Applicant

Application for a porch rebuild; referral from Zoning Board of Adjustment. Chair Canfield stated upon finding the need for a variance, this is no longer a minor work review.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES

July 11, 2019

Wilbur Henry was sworn in. Mr. Henry, referring to the plans, stated a variance is required. A materials list including Trex Composite Decking was presented. The patio door will be Anderson.

Commissioner Esquivel asked if a door will replace the windows. Mr. Henry confirmed.

Commissioner Sharma questioned if the deck will be extended. Mr. Henry confirmed.

Commissioner Sharma asked if the new structure is requiring the variance. Mr. Henry confirmed.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Gaylord to approve Application #436 as submitted, seconded by Commissioner Esquivel and with a roll call vote as follows:

Mr. Frenkel-Yes

Mrs. Canfield-Yes

Mrs. Gaylord-Yes

Mrs. Esquivel-Yes

Mrs. Sharma-Yes

Mrs. Wanga-Yes

Application #434; 157 Sagamore Road; Block #201, Lot #14; Non-Contributing property; Wyoming Historic District / Lalit Kumar – Applicant

Minor Application Appeal to the Commission for new façade materials and other improvements at the property.

Mr. Lalit Kumar, Resident was sworn in.

Chair Canfield stated the minor work review denied the chosen stone therefore Mr. Kumar requested to present to the HPC Committee.

Commissioner Wanga stated that the stone was too contemporary. Mr. Kumar stated the walls are moving due to deteriorated walls. Commissioner Wanga stated that is the nature of the stucco. Commissioner Wanga suggested looking at other materials.

Mr. Kumar stated the older part of the house is in need of the repair.

Commissioner Owolabi stated a decision has to be made if it needs to be saved or be removed. With the information provided it is too difficult to tell.

Commissioner Kramer asked to see the stone style.

Commissioner Esquivel and Chair Canfield suggested an expert is consulted, such as a Structural Engineer.

Commissioner Gaylord stated she is denying the appeal.

Chair Canfield stated making sure that the house is sound is of importance. The current stone is not in keeping with the Historic Community. She would like to see it back to stucco once the areas in need of repair are resolved. She suggested comparing the neighborhood and resemble the other styles of homes in the area.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES**July 11, 2019**

Upon a motion by Commissioner Gaylord to deny Application #434 as submitted, seconded by Commissioner Esquivel and with a roll call vote as follows

Mr. Frenkel-Yes
Mrs. Canfield-Yes
Mrs. Gaylord-Yes
Mrs. Esquivel-Yes
Mrs. Sharma-Yes
Mrs. Wanga-Yes

Application #435; 25 Stewart Road; Block #2202, Lot #1; Contributing property; Short Hills Park Historic District / Sujatha Shanmugasundaram & Sanjay Balan/ Mendham Design – Applicants

Application for major renovations to the house, construction of a new garage, and landscape/driveway improvements at the property.

Richard Keller, Architect, Sujatha Shanmugasundaram, Homeowner and Daniel Ensen was sworn in.

Mrs. Shanmugasundaram stated that the intention is to respect the integrity of the house. After a conceptual review in June, the plans reflect the objectives that were given. Mrs. Shanmugasundaram reviewed last month's conceptual hearing decisions.

A survey marked A-1 was presented, by Mr. James. A tree inventory is included in the plan. Steep slopes were touched on. A circular driveway was presented with a landing area and a curve to protect existing trees and deflect the view of the rear of the house. A two car garage will be removed and tucked under a terrace. The retaining walls will remain as 3 feet or less. A patio was proposed. Mr. James stated that any trees being removed are dead or dying.

Mr. Ensen presented the history of the existing house. Chair Canfield questioned if the placement of the front door is the original. Mr. Ensen stated the original door is now on the side of the house. The front of the house is now Stewart Road. An elevation view was presented. Mr. Enses stated that the goal is to re-create a substantial portico and renovate the rear right corner of the house, filling in an open porch and removing the existing two car garage around the rear of the house. Creating a rear facing three car garage concealing it. Mr. Ensen stated there will be a restoration of the rear of the house including columns and siding. Referring to sheet A-2, and comments in the previous meeting, the changes were presented. Trim will be maintained on the exterior and many elements will be kept and restored. The trim that is replaced will be painted wood rather than a composite as suggested by the board. The siding will be replaced due to rust spots. Painted cedar will replace the existing. Stone veneer will mimic the existing stone on the house. The existing Yankee gutter, following the perimeter was coated with tar. The existing cornice is made up of built up trim. Mr. Ensen proposed, a custom rolled gutter with a metal finish to replace the Yankee gutter. The copper down spouts will remain or be replaced where necessary. The existing windows will be replaced with a full treated wood painted window with simulated divided light, mimicking the current look of the house.

The side elevation was presented, referring to the second level, the windows will be restored. The side wall of the garage, sunk into the ground was shown. The existing chimney will remain. The previous gable peak will be removed from the portico and replaced with a copper roofing, consistent

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES**July 11, 2019**

with other copper elements on the house. Stucco around the perimeter will be stone which was suggested by the commission.

A rear elevation was presented. No changes will be made to the roof on the conservatory area. New windows were proposed to allow for better lighting. A one story addition was presented. A rotting wood deck will be removed and replaced with a finished space with a matching copper roof. The garage is situated below with a stone facade. The columns on the side of the house are extremely rotted and will be replaced with a mold of the existing column which will be a painted material that will not rot.

Attorney Brewer read Mr. Ross's report on his behalf.

Commissioner Esquivel, referring to the site plan, asked if there is a need for the Board of Adjustment. Mr. James stated it is not necessary.

Mrs. Gaylord stated all of her questions have been answered and finds the house lovely.

Commissioner Wanga asked for stone and roof tile materials. Mr. Ensen stated they are pre-existing elements and will have samples available closer to construction. Commissioner Wanga asked what company they will be using for the columns. Mr. Ensen stated Chatsworth. Commissioner Wanga asked if a mockup of the half round will be presented to the subcommittee. Mr. Ensen agreed and stated they would acquire it from the contractor. She stated she feels they did a nice job.

Commissioner Sharma asked if the new portico is in the same location. Mr. Ensen confirmed it is. Referring to a historic photo, Mr. Ensen stated it will not be as large as the original. The detailing will be the same but only extend by 9 feet. Mr. Ensen stated the details on the original house are the ones that will remain the same. Commissioner Sharma asked for a tree plan. Mr. James stated as part of the final development, storm water management and draining will determine the tree replacement plan. Commissioner Sharma asked if the stairs and door were removed from the rear of the house. Mr. Ensen stated the garage will allow you to access the house internally.

Commissioner Frenkel stated he is pleased with the changes. Commissioner Frenkel asked to confirm that the portico will remain the same height. Mr. James confirmed. Commissioner Frenkel questioned if the stone wall will remain. Mr. Ensen stated it will not, but the stone will be matched or reused if salvageable.

Chair Canfield asked for clarification that there is a balcony in the front, which she finds to be a great detail. She asked if it is the existing window. Mr. Ensen confirmed it is. Chair Canfield asked why a railing exists. Mr. Ensen stated the board stated at the previous meeting it should match the structure. Referring to page 3, the balcony's window was questioned. Mr. Ensen stated it is no longer a balcony, but a standing roof. Referring to the right side elevation, Chair Canfield asked for clarification of the balcony from the previous meeting. Mr. Ensen explained the new balusters and roofing in detail. Chair Canfield stated painted metal will not last. Mr. Ensen stated if it is painted appropriately, it will last.

Mrs. Esquivel, Gaylord and Frenkel stated the work was done well.

Commissioner Wanga requested more materials.

Chair Canfield commended them on listening and returning with a wonderful plan. She is concerned about the gutter and the wear over time. She would like samples for the Minor Review Committee.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES**July 11, 2019**

She would like information on the Chatsworth Company as well. Chair Canfield stated if this for any reason goes through the Planning Board, a recommendation will be written by the HPC upon the homeowner's request.

Comments and Questions was open to the audience.

Jonathan Wilf, Resident, was sworn in and stated he is excited to see the house renovated. Mr. Wilf stated there are several children in their family and asked to make it known that the homes have asbestos in the plaster. He stated that this is an issue and he asked to ensure the removal is done correctly.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Esquivel to approve Application #434 as submitted, seconded by Commissioner Wanga and with a roll call vote as follows:

Mr. Frenkel-Yes
 Mrs. Canfield-Yes
 Mrs. Gaylord-Yes
 Mrs. Esquivel-Yes
 Mrs. Sharma-Yes
 Mrs. Wanga-Yes

Application #439; 45 Linden Road; Block #308, Lot #6; Non-Contributing property; Wyoming Historic District / Jenevieve Rappaport – Applicant

Application for major renovations, an addition and other improvements at the property.

Jenevieve Rappaport, Applicant and William Brown, Architect was sworn in.

Mrs. Rappaport stated the goal is to renovate the current home in its entirety. The trees will remain. The size of the house will be increased.

Mr. Brown gave the history of the home. A second floor is being proposed with a two car garage. The base of the home will be stone. Photos and material lists marked A-1 was presented. A painted hearty board and painted trim will be used. A timberline roof will be installed and a porch on the side of the house was presented. Roof types was presented. An addition on the right side was presented with a master bath on the second floor. The rear will have two gables with a roof in-between. A deck, stepping down to a patio in the rear was presented. The breakfast area will exit to a deck. The front stairs will be re-built. The second floor will have four bedrooms and three baths. Gutters were presented as half round copper in white or a simulated copper. The front door is proposed as mahogany and the windows will have wood shutters.

Attorney Brewer read Mr. Ross's suggestions.

Mrs. Rappaport presented material specification sheets marked A-2.

Mr. Brown circulated material samples of hardy plank, white shutters, white garage doors, a front door, hand rails, grey roofing, stone, and trim.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES**July 11, 2019**

Mr. Brown stated Anderson windows will be installed.

Mr. Brown offered to create a color board for the Sub Committee.

Commissioner Wanga asked for clarification on the building area. Mr. Brown explained in detail and stated they are adding 2,200 square feet to the existing house.

Commissioner Wanga asked for clarification of setbacks. Mr. Brown stated it is in line with the others. Commissioner Wanga, Canfield and Mr. Kramer asked if the side yard set backs are remaining. Mr. Brown stated the right side will be adjusted so a variance won't be necessary. Commissioner Wanga questioned if the garages in the Wyoming District have to be detached.

Mr. Owolobi asked if the houses in the area have two car garages. Mr. Brown stated houses around the corner have two car garages.

Chair Canfield asked for a better clarification on what major materials will be used. Mr. Brown reviewed the products and colors chosen. Chair Canfield stated the position of garage doors are elements that are considered. Chair Canfield asked if it was considered to lessen the size and mass of the house. Mr. Brown stated, allowing cars into the driveway was considered and configured accordingly.

Mrs. Nancy Elder, Resident was sworn in. While she appreciates they are building a new house, she feels it does not fit onto the block. She stated all of the houses have detached garages except for the house being referred to. Mrs. Elder stated that a view of a two car garage is disturbing and feels the house is too large. Mrs. Elder asked if the three large trees will remain. Mrs. Rappaport stated they will remain. Mr. Brown stated one tree will be removed for the addition.

Mark Bauman, resident was sworn in. Mr. Bauman stated the house will be another McMansion. Mr. Bauman stated every house on their side of the street has a two car detached garage. Mr. Bauman stated he is concerned about run off once the house is developed. Mr. Bauman stated this house does not fit the neighborhood. The surrounding houses are barn style, ranches and colonials. Mr. Bauman is concerned about height requirements and the width of the house.

Attorney Brewer read the recommendations of Mr. Ross.

Chair Canfield stated after hearing the neighbors feedback, she asked the opinion of the applicant as to if they are considering the suggestions. Mrs. Rappaport stated she takes pride in her work and wants to build a forever home for a family. Although she understands the disruption to change, she wants to build a beautiful home.

Chair Canfield and Mr. Brown clarified that real stone will be used on the base of the house. Mr. Brown stated the drainage will be improved and will be approved by Engineering.

Mr. Kramer stated while most houses have detached garages, a house was recently approved on Cedar Street with a two car garage.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES**July 11, 2019**

Commissioner Wanga stated this house does not have the same garage as everyone else and feels it doesn't fit into the neighborhood. Commissioner Frenkel, Chair Canfield and Commissioner Wanga feel it could have more movement so the garage does not appear attached.

Chair Canfield stated for clarification on the setback. Mr. Brown stated, due to the existing overhang the setback is three feet. Mr. Brown stated he would be willing to move back 6 feet. Chair Canfield suggested they get creative and keep the house within the neighborhood.

Commissioner Sharma stated adding the garages adds to the width of the house. She feels from a Zoning perspective some of the variances should be reconsidered. She suggests the mass should be reduced to help get approval through Zoning.

Commissioner Esquivel asked what is in the setback. Mr. Brown stated the house is in the setback. Commissioner Esquivel stated after hearing the comments, is 6 feet agreed. Mr. Brown agreed.

It was agreed that elements will be considered and they will return to the August meeting to present their changes.

MINOR REVIEWS

Chair Canfield stated the Commissioners will receive a copy of the conclusion of any minor reviews.

OUTREACH

Commissioner Frenkel and Chair Canfield gave an update on the outreach in the community and educating them on what we do.

The first book which was the barn of 25 Stewart is being created and published. Chair Canfield gave the history of the house.

Chair Canfield stated beginning in September, a community information session will be held in various districts letting them know of the minor work review committee, showing them support in the historic district.

NEW BUSINESS

Attorney Brewer stated that the HPC Ordinance is written by the governing body. There is some interest in allowing alternative or synthetic materials by an ordinance revision.

Chair Canfield stated the process is becoming more streamlined. Any ideas to make this a friendly process is accepted.

ADJOURNMENT

With no further suggestions or comments from the Commission, the meeting was adjourned with a motion from Chair Canfield seconded by Commissioner Gaylord and with unanimous voice vote, meeting was adjourned at 10:21 pm.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES

July 11, 2019

Respectfully submitted,

Nicole Verducci, HPC Secretary

The next meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission is August 1, 2019